

The Early Prophets - One Book, One Theme - class # 20

Why Shaul loses his Kingdom because he WINS a War

Source sheet for TIM shiur by Menachem Leibtag/

I. Review of our suggested theme for the book & Review of the units we have identified thus far:

Shmuel chapters 1->7 / Shmuel the Prophet & Judge

Review key proofs, especially based on final psukim of chapter 7

Chapters 8-> 12

The people's request a King/ & Shaul's two coronations

Chapter 13 -> 14 Shaul's Kingdom

Note header format in chapter 13 and concluding verses of chap. 14

Chapters 15-16 - The war with Amalek / & Shaul's punishment

Next unit – beginning in chapter 17

Note new introduction & who is the protagonist

II. Review Shaul – a succesful King / by noting end of chapter 14

מו וַיַּעַל שָׁאוּל, מֵאַחֲרֵי פְּלִשְׁתִּים; וּפְלִשְׁתִּים, הִלְכוּ
לְמִקְוָם. 46 Then Saul went up from following the
Philistines; and the Philistines went to their own
place.

מִזֶּה וְשָׁאוּל לָכַד הַמְּלוּכָה, עַל-יִשְׂרָאֵל; וַיִּלְחַם סָבִיב
בְּכָל-אֹיְבָיו בְּמוֹאָב וּבְבְנֵי-עַמּוֹן וּבְאַדּוֹם וּבְמִלְכֵי
צוּבָה, וּבְפְלִשְׁתִּים, וּבְכָל אֲשֶׁר-יִפְנֶה, יִרְשִׁיעַ. 47 So Saul took the kingdom over Israel, and
fought against all his enemies on every side,
against Moab, and against the children of
Ammon, and against Edom, and against the
kings of Zobah, and against the Philistines; and
whithersoever he turned himself, he put them to
the worse.

מִחַ וַיַּעַשׂ חֵיל, וַיִּדָּ אֶת-עַמְלֵק; וַיִּצֵּל אֶת-יִשְׂרָאֵל, מִיַּד שָׂסָהוּ. {פ} 48 And he did valiantly, and smote the
Amalekites, and delivered Israel out of the
hands of them that spoiled them. {P}

III. The TWO times Hashem informs Shaul that he lost his Kingdom

Chapter 13

For not waiting the full 7 days for Shmuel to come

And then 'bringing a korban'

Chapter 15

For not killing Agag during the battle

& for 'using the choice animals for korbanot'

???? – what is the logic????

א בן-שָׁנָה, שָׁאוּל בְּמַלְכוֹ; וּשְׁתֵּי שָׁנַיִם, מָלַךְ עַל-יִשְׂרָאֵל.

1 Saul was ---- years old when he began to reign; and two years he reigned over Israel.

ב וַיִּבְחַר-לוֹ שָׁאוּל שְׁלֹשֶׁת אַלְפִים, מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל, וַיְהִיו עִם-שָׁאוּל אַלְפִים בְּמִכְמָשׁ וּבְהַר בֵּית-אֵל, וְאֶלֶף הָיוּ עִם-יוֹנָתָן בְּגִבְעַת בְּנֵימִין; וַיִּתֵּר הָעָם, שְׁלַח אִישׁ לְאֹהֲלָיו.

2 And Saul chose him three thousand men of Israel; whereof two thousand were with Saul in Michmas and in the mount of Beth-el, and a thousand were with Jonathan in Gibeath-benjamin; and the rest of the people he sent every man to his tent.

ג וַיִּדֹּף יוֹנָתָן, אֶת נְצִיב פְּלִשְׁתִּים אֲשֶׁר בְּגִבְעָה, וַיִּשְׁמְעוּ, פְּלִשְׁתִּים; וּשָׁאוּל תָּקַע בַּשּׁוֹפָר בְּכָל-הָאָרֶץ לֵאמֹר, יִשְׁמְעוּ הָעִבְרִים.

3 And Jonathan smote the garrison of the Philistines that was in Geba, and the Philistines heard of it. And Saul blew the horn throughout all the land, saying: 'Let the Hebrews hear.'

ד וְכָל-יִשְׂרָאֵל שָׁמְעוּ לֵאמֹר, הִכָּה שָׁאוּל אֶת-נְצִיב פְּלִשְׁתִּים, וְגַם-נִבְאֵשׁ יִשְׂרָאֵל, בַּפְּלִשְׁתִּים; וַיִּצְעֲקוּ הָעָם אַחֲרֵי שָׁאוּל, הַגִּלְגָּל.

4 And all Israel heard say that Saul had smitten the garrison of the Philistines, and that Israel also had made himself odious with the Philistines. And the people were gathered together after Saul to Gilgal.

ה וּפְלִשְׁתִּים נֶאֱסְפוּ לְהִלָּחֵם עִם-יִשְׂרָאֵל, שְׁלֹשִׁים אֶלֶף רֶכֶב וְשֵׁשֶׁת אַלְפִים פָּרָשִׁים, וְעָם, כַּחֹל אֲשֶׁר עַל-שְׂפַת-הַיָּם לְרֹב; וַיַּעֲלוּ וַיַּחֲנוּ בְּמִכְמָשׁ, קִדְמַת בֵּית אֲוֶן.

5 And the Philistines assembled themselves together to fight with Israel, thirty thousand chariots, and six thousand horsemen, and people as the sand which is on the sea-shore in multitude; and they came up, and pitched in Michmas, eastward of Beth-aven.

ו וְאִישׁ יִשְׂרָאֵל רָאוּ כִּי צָר-לוֹ, כִּי נִגַּשׁ הָעָם; וַיִּתְחַבְּאוּ הָעָם, בְּמַעְרוֹת וּבְחַוְחִים וּבְסַלְעִים, וּבַצְּרָחִים, וּבַבְּרוֹת.

6 When the men of Israel saw that they were in a strait--for the people were distressed--then the people did hide themselves in caves, and in thickets, and in rocks, and in holds, and in pits.

ז וְעִבְרִים, עָבְרוּ אֶת-הַיַּרְדֵּן, אֶרֶץ גָּד, וְגִלְעָד; וּשָׁאוּל עוֹדְנֵוּ בְּגִלְגָּל, וְכָל-הָעָם חָרְדוּ אַחֲרָיו.

7 Now some of the Hebrews had gone over the Jordan to the land of Gad and Gilead; but as for Saul, he was yet in Gilgal, and all the people followed him trembling.

ח וַיַּחַל (וַיִּזְחַל) שִׁבְעַת יָמִים, לְמוֹעֵד אֲשֶׁר שָׁמוּאֵל, וְלֹא-בָא שָׁמוּאֵל, הַגִּלְגָּל; וַיִּפֹּץ הָעָם, מֵעָלָיו.

8 And he tarried seven days, according to the set time that Samuel had appointed; but Samuel came not to Gilgal; and the people were scattered from him.

ט וַיֹּאמֶר שָׁאוּל--הֲגִשּׁוּ אֵלַי, הָעֹלָה וְהַשְּׁלָמִים; וַיַּעַל, הָעֹלָה.

9 And Saul said: 'Bring hither to me the burnt-offering and the peace-offerings.' And he offered the burnt-offering.

י וַיְהִי, כַּכֹּלְתוֹ לְהַעֲלוֹת הָעֹלָה, וְהִנֵּה שָׁמוּאֵל, בָּא; וַיֵּצֵא שָׁאוּל לְקִרְאתוֹ, לְבָרְכוֹ.

10 And it came to pass that, as soon as he had made an end of offering the burnt-offering, behold, Samuel came; and Saul went out to meet him, that he might salute him.

יא וַיֹּאמֶר שָׁמוּאֵל, מָה עָשִׂיתָ; וַיֹּאמֶר שָׁאוּל כִּי-רָאִיתִי כִּי-נִפְץ הָעָם מֵעָלַי, וְאַתָּה לֹא-בָאתָ לְמוֹעֵד הַיָּמִים, וּפְלִשְׁתִּים, נֶאֱסָפִים מִכְמָשׁ.

11 And Samuel said: 'What hast thou done?' And Saul said: 'Because I saw that the people were scattered from me, and that thou camest not within the days appointed, and that the Philistines assembled themselves together against Michmas;

יב וַאֲמַר, עָתָה יֵרְדוּ פְּלִשְׁתִּים אֵלַי הַגִּלְגָּל, וּפָנִי יִהְיֶה, לֹא חֲלִיתִי; וְאַתָּה אִפְק, וְאַעֲלֶה הָעֹלָה. {ס}

12 therefore said I: Now will the Philistines come down upon me to Gilgal, and I have not entreated the favour of the LORD; I forced myself therefore, and offered the burnt-offering.' {S}

יג וַיֹּאמֶר שָׁמוּאֵל אֶל-שָׁאוּל, נִסְכַּלְתָּ: לֹא שָׁמַרְתָּ, אֶת-מִצְוֹת יְהוָה אֱלֹהֶיךָ אֲשֶׁר צִוְּךָ, כִּי עָתָה הִכִּין יְהוָה אֶת-מַמְלַכְתְּךָ אֶל-יִשְׂרָאֵל, עַד-עוֹלָם.

13 And Samuel said to Saul: 'Thou hast done foolishly; thou hast not kept the commandment of the LORD thy God, which He commanded thee; for now would the LORD have established thy kingdom upon Israel for ever.

יד וְעָתָה, מִמְּלַכְתְּךָ לֹא-תִקּוּם: בִּקֵּשׁ יְהוָה לּוֹ אִישׁ כְּלָבָבוֹ, וַיִּצְוֶהוּ יְהוָה לְנָגִיד עַל-עַמּוֹ-כִּי לֹא שָׁמַרְתָּ, אֶת אֲשֶׁר-צִוְּךָ יְהוָה. {ס}

14 But now thy kingdom shall not continue, the LORD hath sought him a man after His own heart, and the LORD hath appointed him to be prince over His people, because thou hast not kept that which the LORD commanded thee.' {S}

III. What was the original commandment to wait 7 days- and WHY? Shmuel Aleph chapter 10

ה אַחַר כֵּן, תָּבוֹא גִבְעַת הָאֱלֹהִים, אֲשֶׁר-שָׁם, נִצְבֵי פְלִשְׁתִּים; וַיְהִי כִבְאֹד שָׁם הָעִיר, וּפְגַעַת חֶבֶל נְבָאִים יֵרְדוּ מִהַבְּמָה, וּלְפָנֵיהֶם נֶבֶל וְתֹף וְחָלִיל וְכִנּוֹר, וְהִמָּה מִתְנַבְּאִים.

5 After that thou shalt come to the hill of God, where is the garrison of the Philistines; and it shall come to pass, when thou art come thither to the city, that thou shalt meet a band of prophets coming down from the high place with a psaltery, and a timbrel, and a pipe, and a harp, before them; and they will be prophesying.

ו וַיִּצְלַחַה עָלֶיךָ רוּחַ יְהוָה, וְהִתְנַבֵּית עִמָּם; וְנִהְפַכְתָּ, לְאִישׁ אַחֵר.

6 And the spirit of the LORD will come mightily upon thee, and thou shalt prophesy with them, and shalt be turned into another man.

ז וְהָיָה, כִּי תִבְאִינָה (תְּבֹאֲנָה) הָאֵלֹהִים-- לָךְ: עֲשֵׂה לְךָ אֲשֶׁר תִּמְצָא יָדְךָ, כִּי הָאֱלֹהִים עִמָּךְ.

7 And let it be, when these signs are come unto thee, that thou do as thy hand shall find; for God is with thee.

ח וַיֵּרְדָתָּ לְפָנַי, הַגִּלְגָּל, וְהִנֵּה אָנֹכִי יֹרֵד אֵלֶיךָ, לְהַעֲלוֹת עֲלוֹת לְזִבְחַ זְבַחֵי שְׁלָמִים; שִׁבְעַת יָמִים תִּוָּחַל, עַד-בוֹאִי אֵלַיךָ, וְהוֹדַעְתִּי לְךָ, אֵת אֲשֶׁר תַּעֲשֶׂה.

8 And thou shalt go down before me to Gilgal; and, behold, I will come down unto thee, to offer burnt-offerings, and to sacrifice sacrifices of peace-offerings; seven days shalt thou tarry, till I come unto thee, and tell thee what thou shalt do.'

ט וְהָיָה, כִּהִפְנִיתוּ שְׂכֻמוֹ לָלֶכֶת מֵעַם שְׁמוּאֵל, וַיִּהְיֶךְ-לוֹ אֱלֹהִים, לֵב אַחֵר; וַיָּבֹאוּ כָּל-הָאֲתוֹת הָאֱלֹהִים, בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא. {ס}

9 And it was so, that when he had turned his back to go from Samuel, God gave him another heart; and all those signs came to pass that day. {S}

Discuss – What is the logic of this ‘single’ exception to the rule
Compare this verse with the story in chapter 13

Relate to the original ‘religious’ danger of establishing a Monarchy
Chapter 8

יח וַיִּזְעַקְתֶּם, בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא, מִלִּפְנֵי מַלְכְּכֶם, אֲשֶׁר בְּחַרְתֶּם לָכֶם; וְלֹא-יַעֲנֶה יְהוָה אֶתְכֶם, בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא.

18 And ye shall cry out in that day because of your king whom ye shall have chosen you; and the LORD will not answer you in that day.'

יט וַיִּמָּאֲנוּ הָעָם, לִשְׁמַע בְּקוֹל שְׁמוּאֵל; וַיֹּאמְרוּ לֵאמֹר, כִּי אִם-מֶלֶךְ יִהְיֶה עָלֵינוּ.

19 But the people refused to hearken unto the voice of Samuel; and they said: 'Nay; but there shall be a king over us;

כ וְהָיִינוּ גַם-אֲנַחְנוּ, כְּכָל-הַגּוֹיִם; וְשִׁפְטָנוּ מִלְּפָנָיו, וַיִּצָּא לְפָנֵינוּ, וַיִּלָּחֶם אֶת-מִלְחַמֹּתֵינוּ.

20 that we also may be like all the nations; and that our king may judge us, and go out before us, and fight our battles.'

כא וַיִּשְׁמַע שְׁמוּאֵל, אֵת כָּל-דְּבָרֵי הָעָם; וַיְדַבֵּר, בְּאָזְנֵי יְהוָה. {פ}

21 And Samuel heard all the words of the people, and he spoke them in the ears of the LORD.

Note the danger of winning a war w/o divine intervention.

Possible solution

The King winning a war, in a manner that makes clear to everyone that Hashem gets the credit

[keep this in mind when we discuss David's rise to power]

Also

Note contrast between the actions of Yonatan vs. those of Shaul –

In the story of the battle described in chapters 13 & 14

IV. The war against Amalek

Discuss – why is it forbidden to take from the 'booty'

Chapter 15

יז וַיֹּאמֶר שְׁמוּאֵל--הֲלוֹא אִם-קָטָן אַתָּה בְּעֵינַיִךְ, רֹאשׁ שְׁבֵטֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל אַתָּה; וַיִּמְשַׁח הָיְהוָה לְמֶלֶךְ, עַל-יִשְׂרָאֵל.

17 And Samuel said: 'Though thou be little in thine own sight, art thou not head of the tribes of Israel? And the LORD anointed thee king over Israel;

יח וַיִּשְׁלַח הָיְהוָה, בְּדַרְךְ; וַיֹּאמֶר, לֵךְ וְהַחֲרַמְתָּ אֶת-הַחֲטָאִים אֶת-עַמְלֵק, וְנִלְחַמְתָּ בּוֹ, עַד כְּלוֹתֵם אֹתָם.

18 and the LORD sent thee on a journey, and said: Go and utterly destroy the sinners the Amalekites, and fight against them until they be consumed.

יט וְלָמָּה לֹא-שָׁמַעְתָּ, בְּקוֹל יְהוָה; וַתַּעַט, אֶל-הַשָּׁלַל, וַתַּעַשׂ הָרַע, בְּעֵינַיִי יְהוָה. {ס}

19 Wherefore then didst thou not hearken to the voice of the LORD, but didst fly upon the spoil, and didst that which was evil in the sight of the LORD?' {S}

כ וַיֹּאמֶר שְׂאוּל אֶל-שְׁמוּאֵל, אֲשֶׁר שָׁמַעְתִּי בְּקוֹל יְהוָה, וְאֵלֶיךָ, בְּדַרְךְ אֲשֶׁר-שָׁלַחְנִי יְהוָה; וְאָבִיא, אֶת-אַגַּג מֶלֶךְ עַמְלֵק, וְאֶת-עַמְלֵק, הַחֲרַמְתִּי.

20 And Saul said unto Samuel: 'Yea, I have hearkened to the voice of the LORD, and have gone the way which the LORD sent me, and have brought Agag the king of Amalek, and have utterly destroyed the Amalekites.

כא וַיִּקַּח הָעָם מִהַשָּׁלַל צֹאן וּבָקָר, רֵאשִׁית הַחֲרָם, לְזִבְחַ לַיהוָה אֱלֹהֶיךָ, בְּגִלְגַּל. {ס}

21 But the people took of the spoil, sheep and oxen, the chief of the devoted things, to sacrifice unto the LORD thy God in Gilgal.' {S}

כב וַיֹּאמֶר שְׁמוּאֵל, הַחֲפֹץ לַיהוָה בְּעֹלוֹת וּזְבָחִים, כְּשֹׁמֵעַ, בְּקוֹל יְהוָה: הֲיֵנָה שְׁמֹעַ מִזְבֵּחַ טוֹב, לְהִקְשִׁיב מִחֶלֶב אֵילִים.

22 And Samuel said: 'Hath the LORD as great delight in burnt-offerings and sacrifices, as in hearkening to the voice of the LORD? Behold, to obey is better than sacrifice, and to hearken than the fat of rams.