Could Yirmiyahu Have Saved Shushan?

Finding Prophets in Megillat Esther Adina Blaustein

1. Masechet Megillah 14a - 15a

Who were the seven prophetesses? Sarah, Miriam, Deborah, Hannah, Abigail, Huldah and Esther...

Esther, as it is written: "And it came to pass on the third day that Esther clothed herself in royalty" (Esther 5:1). It should have said: Esther clothed herself in royal garments. Rather, this alludes to the fact that she clothed herself with a divine spirit of inspiration. It is written here: "And she clothed herself," and it is written elsewhere: "And the spirit clothed Amasai" (I Chronicles 12:19). ...

Rav Naḥman said: Malachi the prophet is in fact Mordecai, and why was he called Malachi? To indicate that he was second to the king [melekh], as Mordecai was appointed such, as is recorded at the end of the Megilla. Baruch, the son of Neriah; Seraiah, the son of Mahseiah; Daniel; Mordecai; Bilshan; Haggai; Zechariah; and Malachi; all prophesied in the second year of the reign of Darius. The fact that the baraita mentions Mordecai and Malachi separately indicates that they were two different people. The Gemara concludes: This is indeed a conclusive refutation....

The verse states: "Then Esther called for Hathach, one of the king's chamberlains, whom he had appointed to attend upon her" (Esther 4:5). Rav said: Hathach is in fact the prophet Daniel. And why was he called Hathach? Because he was cut down [hatakh] from his greatness. And Shmuel expounded the name Hathach as derived from hatakh in the opposite sense, as he said: Daniel was called Hathach because all the affairs of the kingdom were decided [nehtakhin] by his word.

שֶׁבַע נְבִיאוֹת מֵאן נִינְהוּ? שֶׂרָה, מִרְיָם, דְּבוֹרָה, חַנָּה, אֲבִיגַיִל, חוּלְדָּה וָאֵסְתִּר...

אֶסְתֵּר — דְּכְתִיב: ״וַיְהִי בַּיּוֹם הַשְּׁלִישִׁי וַתִּלְבֵּשׁ אֶסְתֵּר מַלְכוּת״, בִּגְדֵי מַלְכוּת מִיבְּעֵי לֵיהּ! אֶלְּא שֶׁלְבָשַׁתָּה רוּחַ הַקֹּדֶשׁ, כְּתִיב הָכָא: ״וַתִּלְבַּשׁ״, וּכְתִיב הָתָם: ״וְרוּחַ לִבִשָׁה אֵת עֵּמַשֵׁי וְגוֹ״.

אָמֵר רַב נַחְמָן: מַלְאָכִי — זֶה מָרְדָּכַי, וְלָמָה נִקְרָא שְׁמוֹ מַלְאָכִי? שָׁהָיָה מִשְׁנָה לַמֶּלֶּה. מֵיתִיבִי: בָּרוּךְ בֶּן נַרִיָּה וּשְׂרָיָה בֶּן מַצְשֵׁיָה, וְדָנִיֵּאל וּמְרְדָּכַי בִּלְשָׁן וְחַגַּי, זְכַרְיָה וּמַלְאָכִי בּוּלָן נִתְנַבְּאוּ בִּשְׁנַת שְׁתַּיִם לְדָרְיָנֶשׁ. תִּיוּבְתָּא.

״וַתִּקְרָא אֶסְתֵּר לַנְתָּרְ״, אֶמֵר רַב: הַתָּך זָה דָּנִיאֵל, וְלָמָה נִקְרָא שְׁמוֹ הַתָּךְ — שֶׁחֲתָכוּהוּ מִגְּדוּלָּתוֹ. וּשְׁמוּאֵל אָמַר: שֶׁכָּל דִּבְרֵי מַלְכוּת נַחָתַּכִין עַל פִּיו.

2. Yirmiyahu Chapter 7

The word which came to Jeremiah from the LORD: Stand at the gate of the House of the LORD, and there proclaim this word: Hear the word of the LORD, all you of Judah who enter these gates to worship the LORD! Thus said the LORD of Hosts, the God of Israel: Mend your ways and your actions, and I will let you dwell^{-a} in this place. Don't put your trust in illusions and say, "The Temple of the LORD, the Temple of the LORD, the Temple of the LORD are these [buildings]." ... See, you are relying on illusions that are of no avail. Will you steal and murder and commit adultery and swear falsely, and sacrifice to Baal, and follow other gods whom you have not experienced, and then come and stand before Me in this House which bears My name and say, "We are safe"?—[Safe] to do all these abhorrent things! Do you consider this House, which bears My name, to be a den of thieves? As for Me, I have been watching—declares the LORD.

א הַדָּבֶר אֲשֶׁר הָיָה אֶל-יִרְמְיָהוּ, מֵאֵת ה' לֵאמֹר. ב עֲמֹד, בְּשַׁצַר בַּית ה', וְקָרָאתָ שָׁם, אֶת-הַדָּבֶר הַזָּה; וְאָמַרְתָּ שְׁם, אֶת-הַדָּבֶר הַזָּה; וְאָמַרְתָּ שְׁמִּתְוֹת, לַיִּהוָה. {ס} ג פֹּה-אָמֵר ה' צְּבָאוֹת, לְהִשְׁרָצֵל, הֵיטִיבוּ דַרְכֵיכֶם, וּמַעַלְלֵיכֶם; וַאֲשַׁבְּנָה אַלְקיִשְּׁרָאֵל, הֵיטִיבוּ דַרְכֵיכֶם, וּמַעַלְלֵיכֶם; וַאֲשַׁבְּנָה אָתְכֶם, בַּפֶּקוֹם הַזָּה. ד אַל-תִּבְטְחוּ לָכֶם, אֶל-דִּבְרֵי הַשָּׁקֶר לֵאמֹר: הֵיכֵל ה' הֵיכֵל ה' הֵיכֵל ה' הַפָּה.... ח הַנָּה אַמֶּם בֹּטְחִים לָכֶם, עַל-דִּבְרֵי הַשְּׁכֵר -לְבְלְתִי, הוֹנָה אַמֶם בֹּטְחִים לָכֶם, עַל-דִּבְרֵי הַשְּׁכֵר לֹא-יְדַעְמָם. י הוֹעִלּה, אַחֲרֵי אֱלְהִים אֲחַרִים--אֲשֶׁר לֹא-יְדַעְמֶּם. י וְהָלֹדְ, אַחֲרֵי אֱלְהָים אֲחַרִים--אֲשֶׁר לֹא-יְדַעְמֶּם. י וְבָּאֹרְ, וַבְּעַלְרָת בָּנִי, בַּבֵּיִת הַזָּה אֲשֶׁר לֹא-יְדַעְמֶּם. י וְבָּלְר, אַמְרַ הָּתְּלְהָם, נִצֵּלְנִי, בַּבֵּית הָזָה הַבָּיִת הַזָּה הַבִּית הַזָּה הַבִּית הַזָּה הַבִּית הַזָּה הָאָר. יִבְּלְרָא-שְׁמִי עָלָיו--בְּעִינֵיכֶם; גַּם אָנֹכִי הִנָּה רָאִיתִי, אָמִר בָּלִר הְנִּבְרָת הָנָה הָבִית הָזָּה הַבַּיִת הַנָּה רָאִיתִי, וְאָבַרְת הְנָבְיִר בְּעִינִיכֶם; גַּם אָנֹכִי הְנָה רָאִיתִי, נְאָם-ה'.

3. Yirmiyahu Chapter 38

Shephatiah son of Mattan, Gedaliah son of Pashhur, Jucal son of Shelemiah, and Pashhur son of Malchiah heard what Jeremiah was saying to all the people:

"Thus said the LORD: Whoever remains in this city shall die by the sword, by famine, and by pestilence; but whoever surrenders to the Chaldeans shall live; he shall at least gain his life^{-a} and shall live.

Thus said the LORD: This city shall be delivered into the hands of the king of Babylon's army, and he shall capture it."

Then the officials said to the king, "Let that man be put to death, for he disheartens the soldiers, and all the people who are left in this city, by speaking such things to them. That man is not seeking the welfare of this people, but their harm!"

King Zedekiah replied, "He is in your hands; the king cannot oppose you in anything!"King Zedekiah sent for the prophet Jeremiah, and had him brought to him at the third entrance of the House of the LORD. And the king said to Jeremiah, "I want to ask you something; don't conceal anything from me."

Jeremiah answered the king, "If I tell you, you'll surely kill me; and if I give you advice, you won't listen to me."

Thereupon King Zedekiah secretly promised Jeremiah on oath: "As the LORD lives who has given us this life," I will not put you to death or leave you in the hands of those men who seek your life."

א וַיִּשָׁמֵע שָׁפַטִיה בֶן-מַתַּן, וּגִדַלְיַהוּ בֵּן-פַּשָׁחוּר, וְיוּכַל בֶּן-שֶׁלֶמְיָהוּ, וּפַשְׁחוּר בֶּן-מַלְכִּיָה: ָאֶת-הַדְּבָרִים--אֲשֶׁר יִרְמְיָהוּ מְדַבֵּר אֵל-כַּל-הַעַם, ַלַאמר. ב כּה, אָמַר ה', הַיֹּשֶׁב בָּעִיר הַזֹּאת, יָמוּת בַּחָרֵב בַּרַעַב וּבַדַּבֵר; וְהַיֹּצֵא אֵל-הַכַּשִׂדִים יחיה (וְחָיָה), וְהָיִתָה-לּוֹ נַפִּשׁוֹ לְשַׁלָל וָחָי. {ס} ג כֹּה, אָמַר ה': הָנַּתֹן תִּנָּתֵן הָעִיר הַזֹּאת, כְּיֵד חֵיל מֶלֶךְ-בַּבֶל--וּלְכַדָה. ד וַיֹּאמָרוּ הַשַּׂרִים אֵל-הַמֵּלֶךְ, יוּמַת נַא אֵת-הַאָישׁ הַזֵּה--כִּי-עַל-כֵּן הוּא-מָרַפַּא אָת-יִדֵי אַנְשֵׁי הַמְּלְחָמָה הַנְּשָׁאָרִים בַּעִיר הַזֹּאת ואָת יִדִי כַּל-הַעַם, לְדַבָּר אֵלִיהֶם כַּדְּבַרִים הַאָּלָה: כִּי הַאִישׁ הַזָּה, אֵינְנוּ דֹרֵשׁ לְשַׁלוֹם לַעֲם הַזָּה--כִּי אָם-לְרָעָה. ה וַיֹּאמֶר הַמֶּלֶךְ צִדְקִיָּהוּ, הִנֵּה-הוּא בַּיַרְכֵם: כִּי-אֵין הַמֵּלֶךְ, יוּכַל אֵתְכֵם דַּבַר.... יד וַיִּשָׁלַח הַמֶּלֶךְ צִדְקִיָּהוּ, וַיִּקַח אֶת-יִרְמְיָהוּ הַנַּבִיא אַלָיו, אֵל-מַבוֹא הַשִּׁלִישִׁי, אֲשֶׁר בָּבֵית ה'; וַיֹּאמֶר הַמֶּלֶךְ אֶל-יִרְמְיָהוּ, שֹאֵל אֲנִי אֹתְךּ דְּבָר--אַל-תְּכַחֵד מְמֵנִי, דַבַר. טו וַיֹּאמֶר יִרְמִיָהוּ, אֱל-צְדְקִיָּהוּ, כִּי אַגיד לָדָ, הַלוֹא הַמֶת תִּמִיתַנִי; וַכִי, אֵיעַצְדָּ, לֹא ַתִשָּׁמַע, אֵלַי. טז וַיִּשָּׁבַע הַמֶּלֶךְ צִּדְקִיָּהוּ, אַל-יָרִמְיַהוּ--בַּסֶתֵר לֵאמֹר: חַי-ה' את אֲשֶׁר ָעַשַּׂה-לָנוּ אֶת-הַנֶּפֶשׁ הַוֹּאת, אָם-אֲמִיתֶךּ, וָאָם-אֶתֶּנָךְ בִּיַד הָאֲנָשִׁים הָאֱלֶה, אֲשֶׁר מְבַקְשִׁים

Then Jeremiah said to Zedekiah, "Thus said the LORD, the God of Hosts, the God of Israel: If you surrender to the officers of the king of Babylon, your life will be spared and this city will not be burned down. You and your household will live.

But if you do not surrender to the officers of the king of Babylon, this city will be delivered into the hands of the Chaldeans, who will burn it down; and you will not escape from them."

King Zedekiah said to Jeremiah, "I am worried about the Judeans who have defected to the Chaldeans; that they [the Chaldeans] might hand me over to them to abuse me."

"They will not hand you over," Jeremiah replied. "Listen to the voice of the LORD, to what I tell you, that it may go well with you and your life be spared.

For this is what the LORD has shown me if you refuse to surrender: All the women who are left in the palace of the king of Judah shall be brought out to the officers of the king of Babylon; and they shall say: The men who were your friends/ Have seduced you and vanquished you. / Now that your feet are sunk in the mire, They have turned their backs [on you]. / They will bring out all your wives and children to the Chaldeans, and you yourself will not escape from them. You will be captured by the king of Babylon, and this city shall be burned down."-f Zedekiah said to Jeremiah, "Don't let anyone know about this conversation, or you will die. If the officials should hear that I have spoken with you, and they should come and say to you. 'Tell us what you said to the king; hide nothing from us, or we'll kill you.^{-h} And what did the king say to you?' say to them, 'I was presenting my petition to the king not to send me back to the house of Jonathan to die there." All the officials did come to Jeremiah to question him; and he replied to them just as the king had instructed him. So they stopped questioning him, for the conversation had not been overheard. Jeremiah remained in the prison compound until the day Jerusalem was captured.

אֶת-נַפִּשֶׁךָּ. {ס} יז וַיֹּאמֶר יִרְמִיָהוּ אֶל-צִדְקִיָּהוּ (ס) כֹה-אַמַר ה' אלקיצָבַאוֹת אלקייִשְׂרַאֵל, אָם-יָצֹא תַצֵא אֶל-שָׂרֵי מֶלֶךְ-בָּכֶל וְחָיְתָה נַפְשֶׁךְ, וָהַעִיר הַזֹּאת, לֹא תִשַּׂרֵף בַּאֵשׁ; וְחַיָתַה, אַתַּה וּבֵיתֶדָּ. יח וָאָם לֹא-תֵצֵא, אֶל-שַּׂרֵי מֶלֶדְ בָּבֶל--וְנִתְנַה הָעִיר הַזֹּאת בִּיַד הַכַּשִׂדִים, וּשְׂרָפוּהָ בַּאֵשׁ; וָאַתַּה, לֹא-תִמַּלֵט מִיַּדַם. {ס} יט וַיֹּאמֶר הַמֶּלֶךְ צָדְקִיָּהוּ, אֱל-יִרְמִיַהוּ: אַנִּי דֹאֵג אֶת-הַיָּהוּדִים, אֱשֶׁר נַפָּלוּ אֱל-הַכַּשְׂדִים--פַּן-יִתְנוּ אֹתִי בָּיָדָם, וְהָתְעַלְלוּ-בִי. כ וַיֹּאמֶר יִרְמִיָהוּ, לֹא יָתֵנוּ; שָׁמֵע-נַא בָּקוֹל ה', לַאֲשֶׁר אֲנִי דֹבֵר אָלֶידְ--וְיִיטַב לְדָּ, וּתְחִי נַפְּשֶׁדְּ. כא וְאִם-מָאֵן אַתָּה, לָצֵאת--זֶה הַדָּבָר, אֲשֶׁר הָרְאַנִי ה'. כב וְהִנֵּה ֶכַל-הַנָּשִׁים, אֲשֶׁר נִשְׁאֲרוּ בָּבֵית מֶלֶךְ-יִהוּדָה, מוּצָאוֹת, אֵל-שַׂרֵי מֵלֶךְ בַּבֶל; וְהַנַּה אֹמְרֹת, הָסִיתוּךְ וַיַכָלוּ לָךָ אַנְשֵׁי שָׁלֹמֶךָ, הַטִּבָּעוּ בַבֹּץ רַגְלֵךְ, נַסֹגוּ ַכג וָאֶת-כַּל-נַשִּׁידְ וָאֵת-כַּנֵידְ, מוֹצָאִים אֶל-הַכַּשְׂדִּים, וְאַתַּה, לֹא-תַמַּלֵט מִיַּדַם: כִּי בָיַד מֱלֶךּ-בַּבֶל תִּתַּפֵשׁ, וְאֵת-הַעִיר הַזֹּאת תִּשְׂרֹף בַּאֵשׁ. {ס} כד וַיֹּאמֶר צִדְקִיָּהוּ אֱל-יַרְמִיַהוּ, אִישׁ אַל-יַדַע בַּדְבַרִים-הַאֵּלֵה--וְלֹא תַמוּת. וְכִי-יִשָּׁמְעוּ הַשַּׂרִים, כִּי-דְבַּרְתִּי אָתַּדְ, וּבָאוּ אֵלֵיךְ וְאָמָרוּ אֵלֵיךּ הַגִּידָה-נַּא לָנוּ מַה-דְּבַּרְתַּ אֶל-הַמֶּלֶךְ אַל-תַּכַחַד מִמְנוּוּ, וַלֹא נִמִיתַדְ; וּמַה-דָּבֵּר אֵלֵידְ, הַמֶּלֶךָ. כוּ וָאָמַרָתַ אַלֵיהֶם, מַפִּיל-אַנִי תִחְנַּתִי לְפְנֵי הַמֶּלֶךְ, לְבַלְתִּי הַשִּׁיבֵנִי בֵּית יְהוֹנָתָן, לַמוּת שָׁם. (פּ) כז וַיַּבֹאוּ כַל-הַשַּׂרִים אֵל-יַרְמִיָהוּ, וַיִּשְׁאֵלוּ אֹתוֹ, וַיַּגֵּד לָהֶם כְּכָל-הַדְּבָרִים הָאֵלֶה, אֲשֶׁר צְּוָה הַמֶּלֶך; וַיַּחַרָשׁוּ מִמְנוּוּ, כִּי לֹא-נִשְׁמַע הַדַּבַר. כח וַיֶּשֶׁב יִרְמִיָהוּ בַּחַצַר הַמַּטָּרָה, עַד-יוֹם אֲשֶׁר-נִלְכָּדָה יִרוּשָׁלָם; {ס} וְהָיָה, כַּאֲשֶׁר נִלְכָּדָה יִרוּשָׁלָם.

When Hathach came and delivered Mordecai's message to Esther...Mordecai had this message delivered to Esther: "Do not imagine that you, of all the Jews, will escape with your life by being in the king's palace. On the contrary, if you keep silent in this crisis, relief and deliverance will come to the Jews from another quarter, while you and your father's house will perish. And who knows, perhaps you have attained to royal position for just such a crisis." Then Esther sent back this answer to Mordecai: "Go, assemble all the Jews who live in Shushan, and fast in my behalf...

ט וַיָּבוֹא, הַתָּדְ; וַיַּגֵּד לְאֶסְתֵּר, אֵת דִּבְרֵי מְרְדֵּכִי.

יג וַיֹּאמֶר מָרְדֵּכִי, לְהָשִׁיב אֶל-אֶסְתֵּר: אַל-הְּדַמִּי בְנַפְּשֵׁךְ,

לְהִמְּלֵט בֵּית-הַמֶּלֶךְ מִכָּל-הַיְּהוּדִים. יד כִּי אִם-הַחֲרֵשׁ

תַּחֲרִישִׁי, בְּעֵת הַזֹּאת--רֶוַח וְהַצְּלָה יַצְמוֹד לַיְּהוּדִים

מְמָקוֹם אַחַר, וְאַתְּ וּבֵית-אָבִידְ תֹאבֵדוּ; וּמִי

יוֹדַעַ--אִם-לְעֵת בָּזֹאת, הָגַּעַהְ לַמַּלְכוּת. טו וַתֹּאמֶר אֶסְתֵּר,

לְהָשִׁיב אֵל-מַרְדֵּכָי. טוֹ לֵךְ כְּנוֹס אֵת-כָּל-הַיְּהוּדִים ...