

Talmudic Personalities

Nechama Goldman Barash

The Students of Shemaya and Avtalyon: End of the Hasmonean Era

<p>Hagiga Mishna 2:2 Shemaya says: he may [lay his hands]; Avtalyon says: he may not lay his hands. Hillel and Menahem did not differ. Menahem left and Shammai replaced him. Shammai says: not to lay. Hillel says to lay. The former were patriarchs and the latter were heads of the court.</p> <p>B. Talmud 16b Menahem left and Shammai replaced him etc. Where did he go? Abaye said: He left for the path of evil. Rava said: He joined the king's service. We also learned this in a beraita: Menahem left to serve the king and eighty pairs of students dressed in silk went with him (and abandoned Torah to work for the king).</p> <p>Yerushalmi Hagiga 2:2 Where did he go? There are those who say from one extreme to another. And there are those who say he left against his will, he and eighty pairs of disciples, clad in golden embroidered silk garments, with faces blackened like the sides of a pot. For they had been told, "Write on the horn of an ox that you have no part in the God of Israel."</p>	<p>יוסי בן יועזר אומר שלא לסמוך, יוסי בן יוחנן אומר לסמוך. יהושע בן פרחיה אומר שלא לסמוך, נתאי הארכלי אומר לסמוך. יהודה בן טבאי אומר שלא לסמוך, שמעון בן גטח אומר לסמוך. שמעיה אומר לסמוך. אבטליון אומר שלא לסמוך. הלל ומנחם לא נחלקו. יצא מנחם, נכנס שמאי. שמאי אומר שלא לסמוך, הלל אומר לסמוך. הראשונים היו נשיאים, ושניים להם אב בית דין:</p> <p>יצא מנחם ונכנס שמאי כו'. להיכן יצא? אביי אומר: יצא לתרבות רעה. רבא אומר: יצא לעבודת המלך. תניא נמי הכי: יצא מנחם לעבודת המלך, ויצאו עמו שמונים זוגות תלמידים לבושין סיריקון.</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Antiquities XV, 10:5

There was a certain Essene named Menahem whose whole conduct of life attested to his virtue, and especially in his having received from God a foreknowledge of the future. This man once saw Herod when he was still a schoolboy and saluted him as "King of the Jews." Herod who thought that the man either did not know who he was or was teasing him, reminded him that he was only a private citizen. Menahem however, gently smiled and slapped him on the backside, saying "Nevertheless, you will be king and you will rule the kingdom successfully for you have been found worthy of this by God. And you will remember the slaps given by Menahem..." As Herod gradually rose to the throne and to good fortune and achieved the height of his power, he sent for Menahem...and from then on he held all Essenes in esteem.

Shir Hashirim Zuta, 8, Buber p. 38

Another interpretation: "Flee my beloved..." When? In the days of Menahem and Hillel. For there was a dispute between them and Menahem left, together with eight hundred students clad in golden embroidered silk. Hanan ben Matron and Ba'inan ben Yehuda, Menahem's brothers came and killed him. Then Elazar and his students arose and hacked him into pieces. At that same time, Orhamo's men had besieged Jerusalem and defiled all

of its women. Elazar and his students arose and killed all of the besieging soldiers. At that same time, Jerusalem was plunged into strife. Regarding that time they said: Flee my beloved and become like a gazelle..."

Shammai's Leadership

<p>Mishna Sukkah 2:8 Women, slaves and minors are exempt from dwelling in the sukkah. A minor who is not dependent on his mother is obligated in sukkah. Shammai's daughter in law once had a baby. He broke away some of the roof plaster and made a sukkah over the bed for the sake of the child.</p>	<p>נָשִׁים וְעֶבְדִּים וְקֹטְנִים, פְּטוּרִים מִן הַסֻּכָּה. קָטָן שְׂאִינוֹ צָרִיךְ לְאִמוֹ, חַיֵּב בַּסֻּכָּה. מִעֲשֵׂה וְיִלְדָה כְּלָתוֹ וּפָחַת אֶת הַמַּעֲזִיבָה וְסִבֵּךְ עַל גְּבִי נֶשֶׁל שַׁמַּאי הַזֶּקֶן הַמָּטָה בְּשִׁבִיל הַקָּטָן</p>
<p>Tosefta Yom Kippurim 4:2 Girls should be trained to fast for a year or two before reaching puberty so that they may get accustomed to the mitzvot. Rabbi Akiva would expel fathers from the study house so that they could feed their daughters. Once, Shammai did not wish to feed his son so they decreed upon him until he fed them by hand.</p>	<p>תינוקות סמוך לפירקן מחנכין אותן בפני שנה ובפני שתיים בשביל שיהיו רגילין במצות ר"ע היה מפטיר [מבה"מ] בשביל תינוקות שיאכילום אבותיהם מעשה בשמאי הזקן שלא רצה להאכיל את בנו וגזרו עליו חכמים והאכילוהו בידו.</p>

The Beginning of Hillel's Leadership

<p>תוספתא פסחים ד': יג-יד פעם אחת חל י"ד להיות בשבת שאלו את הלל הזקן פסח מהו שידחה את השבת אמר להם וכי פסח אחד יש לנו בשנה שדוחה [את השבת] הרבה מג' מאות פסחים יש לנו [בשנה ודוחין] את השבת חברו עליו כל העזרה אמר להם תמיד קרבן צבור דוחה את השבת אף פסח קרבן צבור דוחה את השבת דבר אחר נאמר [בתמיד] במדבר כח [מועדו ונאמר] [בפסח] במדבר ט [מועדו] [מה תמיד שנאמר בו מועדו] דוחה את השבת אף [פסח שנא' בו מועדו] דוחה את השבת ועוד ק"ו ומה תמיד שאין חייבין עליו כרת דוחה את השבת פסח שחייבין עליו כרת אינו דין שידחה את השבת ועוד מקובלני מרבתי שפסח דוחה את השבת [ולא פסח ראשון] אלא פסח שני ולא פסח צבור אלא פסח יחיד] אמרו לו מה יהא [על העם] שלא הביאו סכינין ופסחים למקדש אמר להם [הניחו להם רוח"ק עליהן] אם אין נביאים הן בני נביאים הן מה עשו ישראל באותה שעה מי שפסחו טלה טמנו בצמרו גדי קשרו בין קרניו והביאו סכינין ופסחים למקדש [ושחטו את פסחיהן] בו ביום מנו את הלל [נשיא והיה מורה] להם בהלכות הפסח</p> <p>One time the fourteenth [of Nissan] fell on the Sabbath and [the people] asked Hillel the Elder, does the Passover offering override the Sabbath? He said to them, "Do we only have one Passover offering a year that overrides the Sabbath? [Rather,] we have more than three hundred 'Passover offerings' (i.e., the various sacrifices that are brought throughout the year) that override the Sabbath." The entire Temple Courtyard crowded around him. He said to them, "Just as the Tamid is a communal sacrifice that overrides the Sabbath, so too the Passover offering is a communal sacrifice that overrides the Sabbath. And another thing, it is said regarding the Tamid (Num. 28:2), 'its appointed time' and it is [also] said regarding Passover offering (Num. 9:2) 'its appointed time'; thus just as the Tamid as to which it is said 'its appointed time' overrides the Sabbath, so too the Passover offering as to which it is [also] said 'its appointed time' must also override the Sabbath. And moreover, [the matter may be further proven by] a <i>kol v'chomer</i> (a logical deduction): If the Tamid, which does not render one liable for excommunication [by</p>

failing to perform it] overrides the Sabbath, is it not logical that the Passover offering, which *does* render one liable for excommunication [by failing to perform it] must also override the Sabbath? And moreover, I received this tradition from my teachers that Passover overrides the Sabbath, and not [just] the first Passover but [also] the second Passover, and not [just] a Passover offering brought by the community, but also a Passover offering brought by an individual." They said to him, "What should be done about the people that did not bring knives or Passover offerings to consecrate [because they did not know that the Passover offering overrides the Sabbath]?" He said to them, "Leave it to them, [since] the Holy Spirit is upon them. If they are not prophets, they are the children of prophets." What the Israelites did at that moment was that whoever brought a lamb for his Passover offering lodged [his knife] in its wool, [and whoever brought a] kid goat, he tied [his knife] between its horns, and thus they brought knives and Passover offerings to consecrate, and they slaughtered their Passover offerings. And on that day, they appointed Hillel as the Nasi and he taught them all the laws of Passover.

One time King [Herod] Agrippa sought to find out how many were the multitudes [of Israelites], and he said to the Kohanim, separate for me a kidney from each and every Passover offering, and they separated for him six hundred thousand pairs of kidneys, double the number of the exodus from Egypt, and there was not any Passover offering that did not have at least ten registrants, not including those who [could not attend because they] were impure or that had too long of a distance to travel. On that day, they entered the Temple Mount and it could not hold all of them, and they called it the "Passover of the crushed."

Yerushalmi 6:1

HALAKHAH: "Once the Fourteenth fell on the Sabbath and they did not know whether *Pesah* pushes aside the Sabbath or not. They said, we have here a Babylonian who served Shemaya and Avtalion and knows whether *Pesah* pushes aside the Sabbath or not. It is possible that there be hope from him. They sent and called him. He said to him, did you ever hear, if the Fourteenth falls on the Sabbath, whether *Pesah* pushes aside the Sabbath or not? He told them, do we have only one *Pesah* which pushes aside the Sabbath every year? Are there not many *Pesahim* which push aside the Sabbath every year?"

There are Tannaim who state: 100. There are Tannaim who state: 200. There are Tannaim who state: 300. He who says 100, the daily sacrifices of the Sabbath. He who says 200, the daily and additional sacrifices of the Sabbath. He who says 300, the daily and additional sacrifices of the Sabbath, and of holidays, and of New Moons, and of

Pesahim B. Talmud 66a

GEMARA: The Sages taught a *baraita* with regard to the basic *halakha* governing the eve of Passover that **occurs** on Shabbat: **This law was forgotten by the sons of Beteira, who were the leaders of their generation. The fourteenth of Nisan once occurred on Shabbat, and they forgot and did not know whether the Paschal lamb overrides Shabbat or not. They said: Is there any person who knows whether the Paschal lamb overrides Shabbat or not? They said to them: There is a certain man in Jerusalem who came up from Babylonia, and Hillel the Babylonian is his name. At one point, he served the two most eminent scholars of the generation, Shemaya and Avtalyon, and he certainly knows whether the Paschal lamb overrides Shabbat or not. The sons of Beteira sent messengers and called for him. They said to him: Do you know whether the Paschal lamb overrides Shabbat or not? He said to them: Have we but one Paschal lamb during the year that overrides Shabbat? Do we not have many more than two**

semi-holidays. They told him, already we said, there is hope from you.

He started to explain to them by analogy, by an argument *de minore ad majus*, and by equal cut. By analogy: The daily sacrifice is a public offering and *Pesah* is a public offering. Since the daily sacrifice as a public offering pushes aside the Sabbath, also *Pesah* as a public offering pushes aside the Sabbath. By an argument *de minore ad majus*. Since the daily sacrifice, whose action is not subject to extirpation, pushes aside the Sabbath, it is only logical that *Pesah*, whose action is subject to extirpation, push aside the Sabbath. By equal cut. It is said about the daily sacrifice, *at its fixed time*⁹Num. 28:2., and it is said about *Pesah*, *at its fixed time*¹⁰Num. 9:2.. They said to him, we already said, is there hope from a Babylonian? The analogy which you proposed can be answered. No, if you said this about daily sacrifices which are fixed in number, what can you infer for *Pesah* which is not fixed in number? The argument *de minore ad majus* which you proposed can be answered.

No, if you said this about daily sacrifices which are most holy, what can you infer for *Pesah* which is a simple sacrifice¹¹*The relationship between daily sacrifice and Pesah is not that of minor and major; the argument is intrinsically invalid.*

Concerning the equal cut which you proposed, nobody can introduce an equal cut by himself¹²*Equal expressions in the Pentateuch imply equal legal status only if there is a documented tradition that these words were written for this purpose.*

Therefore one can contradict an argument *de minore ad majus*; one cannot contradict an equal cut.

Even though he was sitting and explaining the entire day they did not accept it from him until he said, it should come over me, so I heard from Shemaya and Avtalion. When they heard this from him, they rose

hundred Paschal lambs, i.e., sacrifices, during the year that override Shabbat?

They said to him: From where do you know this? He said to them: “Its appointed time” is stated with regard to the Paschal lamb and “its appointed time” is also stated with regard to the daily offering, for the verse says: “Command the children of Israel and say to them, My offering, the provision of My sacrifice made with fire, for a sweet savor to Me, shall you observe to offer Me at its appointed time” (Numbers 28:2). From here we learn that the daily offering is brought even on Shabbat. Thus, the daily morning and afternoon offerings are brought on more than fifty *Shabbatot* over the course of the year, and two sheep are offered every Shabbat as additional offerings, for a total of more than two hundred sacrifices a year that override Shabbat. **Just as the expression “its appointed time,” which is stated with regard to the daily offering,** indicates that it **overrides Shabbat, so too “its appointed time,” which is stated with regard to the Paschal lamb,** indicates that it **overrides Shabbat.**

And furthermore, it is an *a fortiori* inference: If the daily offering, the neglect of which is not punishable by *karet*, overrides Shabbat, is it not right that the Paschal lamb, the neglect of which is punishable by *karet*, should override Shabbat?

After Hillel brought these proofs, **they immediately seated him at the head and appointed him *Nasi* over them, and he expounded the laws of Passover that entire day.** In the course of his teaching, **he began rebuking them [*mekanteran*] them with words. He said to them: What caused this to happen to you, that I should come up from Babylonia and become *Nasi* over you? It was the laziness in you that you did not serve the two most eminent scholars of the generation living in Eretz Yisrael, Shemaya and Avtalyon.**

and appointed him Patriarch over them. After they had appointed him Patriarch over them, he started to goad^{16*} Greek *κεντρούω* "to spur, goad, hit with a sharp instrument". them with words, and said: What caused you to need this Babylonian? Not that you did not serve the two greats of the world, Shemaya and Avtalion? When he started to goad them with words, practice disappeared from him.

They said to him: What to do with people who did not bring their knives with them? He told them, I was informed of the practice, but I forgot. But let Israel act; if they are not prophets they are descendants of prophets. Then everybody whose Passover sacrifice was a lamb stuck them in its fleece, for a kid goat he bound them to its horns; it turned out that the Passover sacrifices brought their knives with them. When he saw the action he remembered the practice. He told them, this is what I heard from Shemaya and Avtalion.

Rebbi Ze'ira in the name of Rebbi Eleazar. Any teaching which has no pedigree is no teaching.

They said to Hillel: Our teacher, if one forgot and did not bring a knife on the eve of Shabbat and cannot slaughter his Paschal lamb, **what is the law?** Since he could have brought the knife before Shabbat, he cannot bring it on Shabbat; but what should he do in this situation? **He said to them: I once heard this halakha** from my teachers **but I have forgotten it. But leave it to the Jewish people; if they are not prophets** to whom God has revealed His secrets, **they are the sons of prophets**, and will certainly do the right thing on their own.

The next day, on Shabbat that was the eve of Passover, **one whose Paschal offering was a lamb** took the knife and **stuck it in its wool**; and **one whose Paschal offering was a goat**, which does not have wool, **stuck it between its horns**. Hillel **saw the incident and remembered the halakha** that he had once learned **and said: This is the tradition I received from the mouths of Shemaya and Avtalyon**, meaning that this is in fact the proper course of action.

משנה אבות 1:1

משנה קבל תורה מסיני, ומסרה ליהושע, ויהושע לזקנים, וזקנים לנביאים, ונביאים מסרה לאנשי כנסת הגדולה. הם אמרו שלשה דברים, הווי מתונים בדין, והעמידו תלמידים הרבה, ועשו סג לתורה:

אבות דרבי נתן א, פרק ג

[והעמידו תלמידים הרבה] שב"ש אומרים אל ישנה אדם אלא למי שהוא חכם ועניו וכן אבות ועשיר וב"ה אומרים לכל אדם ישנה שהרבה פושעים היו בהם בישראל ונתקרב לתלמוד תורה ויצאו מהם צדיקים חסידים וכשרים:

אבות דרבי נתן ב פרק ד

And raise up many students: the school of Shammai says: Only respectable people should be taught, the sons of respectable fathers and grandfathers. The School of Hillel says: Everyone should be taught. To what may this be compared? To a woman who sets a hen to roost on the eggs. From a large number of eggs she produces a few chickens but from a small number she does not produce any.

תוספתא סוכה 4:2

הלל הזקן אומר למקום שלבי אוהב לשם רגלי מוליכות אותי אם אתה תבא לביתי אני אבא לביתך אם אתה לא תבא לביתי אני לא אבא לביתך שנאמר (שמות כ':כ"א) [שמות כ':כ"א](#) (בכל המקום אשר אזכיר את שמי אבא אליך וברכתיך).

Saints and pious men were dancing before them with torches, and saying words of praise. What were they saying? Happy is he who has not sinned, and whoever has sinned shall be forgiven. Some of them were saying, Happy am I whose youth has not shamed my old age, this was said by the pious men. And others of them were saying, Happy am I whose old age can atone for my youth, this was said by the penitents.

Hillel the Elder used to say : To the place which my heart loves, there my feet lead me. If you come to my house (says God), I will go to there. If you do not come to My house, then I will not go to there. For it is said, "In every place where I record My name I will come unto you, and I will bless you

אבות דרבי נתן י"ב:י'

הוא היה אומר **אם תבא לביתי אני אבא לביתך** למקום שלבי אוהב לשם רגלי מוליכות אותי. אם תבא לביתי אבא לביתך כיצד אלו בני אדם שמשכימים ומעריבים לבתי כנסיות ולבתי מדרשות הקב"ה מברכך לעולם הבא כענין שנא' (שמות כ':כ"א) בכל המקום אשר אזכיר את שמי וגו'. למקום שלבי אוהב לשם רגלי מוליכות אותי כיצד אלו בני אדם שמניחים כספם וזהבם ועולין לרגל להקביל פני שכינה במקדש הקב"ה משמרם בתוך מחניהם שנאמר (שמות ל"ד:כ"ד) ולא יחמוד איש את ארצך בעלותך לראות את פני ה' אלהיך:

He would also say: If you come to my house, I will come to your house. My legs will bring me to the place that my heart loves. If you come to my house, I will come to your house. How so? These are the people who come for the morning and evening prayers at the synagogues and study houses. The Holy Blessed One blessed them in the World to Come. This is like what it says (Exodus 20:21), "In every place where I have My name mentioned [I will come to you and bless you]." My legs will bring me to the place that my heart loves. How so? These are the people who leave their silver and gold and go up to the festival to encounter the face of the Divine Presence in the Temple. The Holy Blessed One will protect them in their encampments, as it says (Exodus 34:24), "No man will covet your land when you go up to appear before the face of the Eternal your God [on one of the three pilgrim festivals]."

He would also say: If I am here, everything is here. I am not here, who is here? Turn it over, and turn over [in it. For everything is in it.] And in all matters, the reward is in proportion to the struggle.

There is a story of Hillel the Elder, that he was walking on the road, and he came upon people who were carrying wheat. He said to them: How much would a *se'ah* cost? They said to him: Two *dinars*. He came upon another group, and asked them: How much would a *se'ah* cost? They said to him: Three *dinars*. [He said: But the first group told me it was only two!] They said to him: You stupid Babylonian! Don't you know that the reward is in proportion to the struggle? He said them: You fools! (And empty ones!) Because I constantly instruct you [that the reward is commensurate with the toil], you are replying so [i.e. in kind]? Thus Hillel the Elder did to them to bring them back to good behavior.

It was also he who saw a skull floating on the water and said to it: Since you drowned others, you were drowned. And those who drowned you will also be drowned. He also

used teach four things in the Babylonian tongue: One who pursues a name, loses his name; One who does not serve the sages, deserves death; One who does not increase, loses; and One who makes use of the crown, perishes, and then it is lost to him. One who pursues a name, loses his name. How so? This teaches us that a person should not seek to be known in the state, for eventually they will begin to take note of him, and then kill him and take his money.

Chagiga 12a

Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel dispute the order of Creation, as **the Sages taught: Beit Shammai say: The heavens were created first and afterward the earth was created, as it is stated: “In the beginning God created the heaven and the earth”** (Genesis 1:1), which indicates that heaven came first. **And Beit Hillel say: The earth was created first, and heaven after it, as it is stated: “On the day that the Lord God made earth and heaven”** (Genesis 2:4). **Beit Hillel said to Beit Shammai: According to your words, does a person build a second floor and build the first floor of the house afterward? As it is stated: “It is He Who builds His upper chambers in the heaven, and has founded His vault upon the earth”** (Amos 9:6), indicating that the upper floor, heaven, was built above the earth. **Beit Shammai said to Beit Hillel: According to your words, does a person make a stool for his feet, and make a seat afterward? As it is stated: “So said the Lord: The heavens are My seat, and the earth My footstool”** (Isaiah 66:1). **But the Rabbis say: Both this and that were created as one, for it is stated: “Indeed, My hand has laid the foundation of the earth, and My right hand has spread out the heavens; when I call to them, they stand up together”** (Isaiah 48:13), implying that they were created as one.

Shabbat 30b

The Sages taught in a *baraita*: A person should always be patient like Hillel and not impatient like Shammai. The Gemara related: There was **an incident involving two people who wagered with each other and said: Anyone who will go and aggravate Hillel to the point that he reprimands him, will take four-hundred zuz. One of them said: I will aggravate him. That day that he chose to bother Hillel was Shabbat eve, and Hillel was washing the hair on his head. He went and passed the entrance to Hillel’s house and in a demeaning manner said: Who here is Hillel, who here is Hillel? Hillel wrapped himself in a dignified garment and went out to greet him. He said to him: My son,**

מסכת שבת ל:

תנו רבנן: לעולם יהא אדם ענוותן בהלל ואל יהא קפדן כשמאי. מעשה בשני בני אדם שהמרו זה את זה, אמרו: כל מי ישלף ויקניט את הלל יטול ארבע מאות זוז. אמר אחד מהם: אני אקניטנו. אותו היום ערב שבת היתה, והלל חפף את ראשו. הלך ועבר על פתח ביתו, אמר: מי כאן הלל, מי כאן הלל? נתעטף ויצא לקראתו. אמר לו: בני, מה אתה מבקש? אמר לו: שאלה יש לי לשאול. אמר לו: שאל בני. שאל: מפני מה ראשיהן של בבליים סגלגלות? אמר לו: בני, שאלה גדולה שאלת. מפני שאין להם חיות פקחות.

what do you seek? He said to him: I have a question to ask. Hillel said to him: Ask, my son, ask. The man asked him: **Why are the heads of Babylonians oval?** He was alluding to and attempting to insult Hillel, who was Babylonian. **He said to him: My son, you have asked a significant question.** The reason is **because they do not have clever midwives.** They do not know how to shape the child's head at birth.

That man **went and waited one hour**, a short while, **returned** to look for Hillel, and **said: Who here is Hillel, who here is Hillel?** Again, Hillel **wrapped himself and went out to greet him.** Hillel **said to him: My son, what do you seek?** The man **said to him: I have a question to ask. He said to him: Ask, my son, ask.** The man asked: **Why are the eyes of the residents of Tadmor bleary [terutot]?** Hillel **said to him: My son, you have asked a significant question.** The reason is **because they live among the sands** and the sand gets into their eyes.

Once again the man **went, waited one hour, returned, and said: Who here is Hillel, who here is Hillel?** Again, **he, Hillel, wrapped himself and went out to greet him. He said to him: My son, what do you seek? He said to him: I have a question to ask. He said to him: Ask, my son, ask.** The man asked: **Why do Africans have wide feet?** Hillel **said to him: You have asked a significant question.** The reason is **because they live in marshlands** and their feet widened to enable them to walk through those swampy areas.

That man **said to him: I have many more questions to ask, but I am afraid lest you get angry. Hillel wrapped himself and sat before him, and he said to him: All of the questions that you have to ask, ask them.** The man got angry and **said to him: Are you Hillel whom they call the Nasi of Israel? He said to him: Yes. He said to him: If it is you, then may there not be many like you in Israel. Hillel said to him: My son, for what reason do you say this? The man said to him: Because I lost four**

הַלֵּל וְהִמְתִּין שָׁעָה אַחַת, חָזַר וְאָמַר: מִי בָּאן הַלֵּל, מִי בָּאן הַלֵּל? נִתְעַטֵּף וַיֵּצֵא לְקִרְאָתוֹ. אָמַר לוֹ: בְּנִי, מָה אַתָּה מְבַקֵּשׁ? אָמַר לוֹ: שְׂאֵלָה יֵשׁ לִי לְשֹׂאֵל. אָמַר לוֹ: שְׂאֵל בְּנִי. שְׂאֵל: מִפְּנֵי מָה עֵינֵיהֶן שֶׁל תַּדְמוֹדִיִּין תְּרוֹטוֹת? אָמַר לוֹ: בְּנִי, שְׂאֵלָה גְדוּלָה שְׂאֵלָתָּ. מִפְּנֵי שְׂדָרִין בֵּין הַחֹלוֹת.

הַלֵּל וְהִמְתִּין שָׁעָה אַחַת, חָזַר וְאָמַר: מִי בָּאן הַלֵּל, מִי בָּאן הַלֵּל? נִתְעַטֵּף וַיֵּצֵא לְקִרְאָתוֹ, אָמַר לוֹ: בְּנִי, מָה אַתָּה מְבַקֵּשׁ? אָמַר לוֹ: שְׂאֵלָה יֵשׁ לִי לְשֹׂאֵל. אָמַר לוֹ: שְׂאֵל בְּנִי. שְׂאֵל: מִפְּנֵי מָה רַגְלֵיהֶם שֶׁל אֲפְרִקַיִים רְחֹבוֹת? אָמַר לוֹ: בְּנִי שְׂאֵלָה גְדוּלָה שְׂאֵלָתָּ — מִפְּנֵי שְׂדָרִין בֵּין בְּצַעֵי הַמַּיִם.

אָמַר לוֹ: שְׂאֵלוֹת הַרְבֵּה יֵשׁ לִי לְשֹׂאֵל, וּמִתְיָרָא אֲנִי שְׂמָא תְבָעוּס. נִתְעַטֵּף וַיֵּשֶׁב לְפָנָיו. אָמַר לוֹ: כָּל שְׂאֵלוֹת שְׂנִישׁ לְךָ לְשֹׂאֵל שְׂאֵל. אָמַר לוֹ אַתָּה הוּא הַלֵּל שְׂקוֹרִין אוֹתְךָ "נְשִׂיא יִשְׂרָאֵל"? אָמַר לוֹ: הֵן. אָמַר לוֹ: אִם אַתָּה הוּא, לֹא יִרְבוּ כְמוֹתְךָ בְּיִשְׂרָאֵל. אָמַר לוֹ: בְּנִי, מִפְּנֵי מָה? אָמַר לוֹ מִפְּנֵי שְׂאֵבְדָתִי עַל יְדֵי אֲרֻבַּע מֵאוֹת זֵז. אָמַר לוֹ: הֵן זְהִיר בְּרוּחָךְ כְּדֵי

<p>hundred zuz because of you. Hillel said to him: Be vigilant of your spirit and avoid situations of this sort. Hillel is worthy of having you lose four hundred zuz and another four hundred zuz on his account, and Hillel will not get upset.</p>	<p>הוא הלל שתאבד על ידו ארבע מאות זוז וארבע מאות זוז, והלל לא יקפיד .</p>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p>The Sages taught: There was an incident involving one gentile who came before Shammai. The gentile said to Shammai: How many Torahs do you have? He said to him: Two, the Written Torah and the Oral Torah. The gentile said to him: With regard to the Written Torah, I believe you, but with regard to the Oral Torah, I do not believe you. Convert me on condition that you will teach me only the Written Torah. Shammai scolded him and cast him out with reprimand. The same gentile came before Hillel, who converted him and began teaching him Torah. On the first day, he showed him the letters of the alphabet and said to him: Alef, bet, gimmel, dalet. The next day he reversed the order of the letters and told him that an <i>alef</i> is a <i>tav</i> and so on. The convert said to him: But yesterday you did not tell me that. Hillel said to him: You see that it is impossible to learn what is written without relying on an oral tradition. Didn't you rely on me? Therefore, you should also rely on me with regard to the matter of the Oral Torah, and accept the interpretations that it contains.</p> <p>There was another incident involving one gentile who came before Shammai and said to Shammai: Convert me on condition that you teach me the entire Torah while I am standing on one foot. Shammai pushed him away with the builder's cubit in his hand. This was a common measuring stick and Shammai was a builder by trade. The same gentile came before Hillel. He converted him and said to him: That which is hateful to you do not do to another; that is the entire Torah, and the rest is its interpretation. Go study.</p> <p>There was another incident involving one gentile who was passing behind the study</p>	<p>תנו רבנן: מעשה בגוי אחד שבא לפני שמאי. אמר לו: כמה תורות יש לכם? אמר לו: שתיים, תורה שבכתב ותורה שבעל פה. אמר לו: שבכתב אני מאמינך, ושבועל פה – איני מאמינך. גיירני על מנת שתלמדני תורה שבכתב. גער בו והוציאו בנדיפה. בא לפני הלל, גייריה. יומא קמא אמר ליה: א"ב ג"ד. למחר אפיף ליה. אמר ליה: והא אתמול לא אמרת לי הכי! אמר ליה: לא עלי דידך קא סמכת? דעל פה נמי סמוך עלי .</p> <p>שוב מעשה בגוי אחד שבא לפני שמאי. אמר לו: גיירני על מנת שתלמדני כל התורה כולה כשאתה עומד על רגל אחת! דחפו באמת הבנין שבידו. בא לפני הלל, גייריה. אמר לו: דעלך סני לחברך לא תעביד – זו היא כל התורה כולה, ואידך פירושה הוא, זיל גמור .</p>
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

hall and heard the voice of a teacher who was teaching Torah to his students and saying the verse: **“And these are the garments which they shall make: A breastplate, and an efod, and a robe, and a tunic of checkered work, a mitre, and a girdle”** (Exodus 28:4). **The gentile said: These garments, for whom are they designated? The students said to him: For the High Priest. The gentile said to himself: I will go and convert so that they will install me as High Priest. He came before Shammai and said to him: Convert me on condition that you install me as High Priest. Shammai pushed him with the builder’s cubit in his hand. He came before Hillel; he converted him.**

Hillel said to him, to the convert: **Is it not the way of the world that only one who knows the protocols [takhsisei] of royalty is appointed king? Go and learn the royal protocols by engaging in Torah study. He went and read the Bible. When he reached the verse which says: “And the common man that draws near shall be put to death”** (Numbers 1:51), the convert said to Hillel: **With regard to whom is the verse speaking? Hillel said to him: Even with regard to David, king of Israel. The convert reasoned an a fortiori inference himself: If the Jewish people are called God’s children, and due to the love that God loved them he called them: “Israel is My son, My firstborn”** (Exodus 4:22), and nevertheless it is written about them: **And the common man that draws near shall be put to death; a mere convert who came without merit, with nothing more than his staff and traveling bag, all the more so that this applies to him, as well.**

The convert came before Shammai and told him that he retracts his demand to appoint him High Priest, saying: **Am I at all worthy to be High Priest? Is it not written in the Torah: And the common man that draws near shall be put to death? He came before Hillel and said to him: Hillel the patient, may blessings rest upon your head as you brought me under the wings of the Divine**

שוב מעשה בגוי אחד שהיה עובר אחורי בית המדרש, ושמע קול סופר שהיה אומר: “ואלה הבגדים אשר יעשו חושן ואפוד”. אמר: הללו למי? אמרו לו: לכהן גדול. אמר אותו גוי בעצמו: אלף ואתגיייר בשביל שישיומי כהן גדול. בא לפני שמאי, אמר לו: גייירני על מנת שתשימיני כהן גדול. דחפו באמת הבגן שבידו. בא לפני הלל, גייריה.

אמר לו: כלום מעמידין מלך אלא מי שיודע טכסיסי מלכות, לך למוד טכסיסי מלכות. הלך וקרא. כיון שהגיע “והזר הקרב יומת”, אמר ליה: מקרא זה על מי נאמר? אמר לו: אפילו על דוד מלך ישראל. נשא אותו גר קל וחומר בעצמו: ומה ישראל שנקראו בנים למקום ומתוך אהבה שאהבם קרא להם: “בני בכורי ישראל”, כתיב עליהם “והזר הקרב יומת” — גר הקל שבא במקלו ובתרמילו, על אחת כמה וכמה.

בא לפני שמאי, אמר לו: כלום ראוי אני להיות כהן גדול? והלא כתיב בתורה: “והזר הקרב יומת”. בא לפני הלל, אמר לו: עמוותן הלל, ינחני לך ברכות על ראשי, שקרבתיני תחת כנפי השכינה. לימים נדווגו שלשתן למקום אחד, אמרו: קפדנותו של

<p>Presence. The Gemara relates: Eventually, the three converts gathered together in one place, and they said: Shammai's impatience sought to drive us from the world; Hillel's patience brought us beneath the wings of the Divine Presence.</p>	<p>שמאי בקשה לטורדנו מן העולם, ענוותנותו של הלל קרבתנו תחת כנפי השכינה.</p>
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------

Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel: Makhloket Matters

<p>Eruvin 13b Rabbi Abba said that Shmuel said: For three years Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel disagreed. These said: The halakha is in accordance with our opinion, and these said: The halakha is in accordance with our opinion. Ultimately, a Divine Voice emerged and proclaimed: Both these and those are the words of the living God. However, the halakha is in accordance with the opinion of Beit Hillel. The Gemara asks: Since both these and those are the words of the living God, why were Beit Hillel privileged to have the halakha established in accordance with their opinion? The reason is that they were agreeable and forbearing, showing restraint when affronted, and when they taught the <i>halakha</i> they would teach both their own statements and the statements of Beit Shammai. Moreover, when they formulated their teachings and cited a dispute, they prioritized the statements of Beit Shammai to their own statements, in deference to Beit Shammai. ...The Sages taught the following baraita: For two and a half years, Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel disagreed. These say: It would have been preferable had man not been created than to have been created. And those said: It is preferable for man to have been created than had he not been created. Ultimately, they were counted and concluded: It would have been preferable had man not been created than to have been created. However, now that he has been created, he should examine his actions that he has performed and seek to correct them. And some say: He should scrutinize his planned actions and evaluate whether or not and in what manner those actions should be performed, so that he will not sin.</p>	<p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת עירובין דף יג עמוד ב אמר רבי אבא אמר שמואל: שלש שנים נחלקו בית שמאי ובית הלל, הללו אומרים הלכה כמותנו והללו אומרים הלכה כמותנו. יצאה בת קול ואמרה: אלו ואלו דברי אלהים חיים הן, והלכה כבית הלל. וכי מאחר שאלו ואלו דברי אלהים חיים מפני מה זכו בית הלל לקבוע הלכה כמותן - מפני שנוחין ועלובין היו, ושונים דבריהן ודברי בית שמאי. ולא עוד אלא שמקדימין דברי בית שמאי לדבריהן.</p> <p><u>תנו רבנן: שתי שנים ומחצה נחלקו בית שמאי ובית הלל. הללו אומרים: נוח לו לאדם שלא נברא יותר משנברא, והללו אומרים: נוח לו לאדם שנברא יותר משלא נברא. נמנו וגמרו: נוח לו לאדם שלא נברא יותר משנברא, עכשיו שנברא — יפשוט במעשיו. ואמרי לה: ימשמש במעשיו.</u></p>
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

<p>Pesachim 88a</p> <p>As we learned in a mishna: One who is half slave and half free man serves his master one day and himself one day; this is the statement of Beit Hillel. Beit Shammai say:</p> <p>88b</p> <p>You have remedied the situation of his master, who benefits fully from all his rights to the slave, but his own situation you have not remedied. How so? He is not able to marry a maidservant, since half of him is already free, and a free Jew may not marry a Canaanite maidservant. He is also not able to marry a free woman, since half of him is still a slave, and a Jewish woman may not marry a Canaanite slave. And if you say he should be idle and not marry, but is it not true that the world was created only for procreation, as it is stated: "He did not create it to be a waste; He formed it to be inhabited" (Isaiah 45:18)? Rather, for the improvement of the world we force his master to make him a free man, and the slave writes a bill accepting his responsibility to pay half his value to his master. This was the original version of the mishna.</p> <p>The ultimate version of the mishna records the retraction of Beit Hillel: And Beit Hillel retracted its position and ruled like Beit Shammai.</p>	<p>פסחים פח.</p> <p>דַּתְּנוּ: מִי שֶׁחֲצִיּוֹ עֶבֶד וְחֲצִיּוֹ בֶן חוֹרִין — עוֹבֵד אֶת רַבּוֹ יוֹם אֶחָד וְאֶת עַצְמוֹ יוֹם אֶחָד, דְּבַרֵי בֵּית הַלֵּל. בֵּית שַׁמַּי אוֹמְרִים :</p> <p>פ"ח ב</p> <p>תִּקְנִיתֶם אֶת רַבּוֹ, וְאֶת עַצְמוֹ לֹא תִקְנִיתֶם. לִישָׁא שְׂפִיחָה אֵינּוּ יָכוֹל — שֶׁכֶּבֶר חֲצִיּוֹ בֶן חוֹרִין, לִישָׁא בֵּת חוֹרִין אֵינּוּ יָכוֹל — שֶׁעֲדִיין חֲצִיּוֹ עֶבֶד. יִבְטֵל, וְהֵלֵא לֹא נִבְרָא הָעוֹלָם אֶלָּא לְפָרְיָהּ וְרַבִּיּהּ, שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר: "לֹא תִהְיֶה בְרָאָה (אֶלָּא) לְשִׁבְתָּ יִצְרָה". אֶלָּא, מִפְּנֵי תִיקוּן הָעוֹלָם כּוֹפִין אֶת רַבּוֹ וְעוֹשֶׂה אוֹתוֹ בֶּן חוֹרִין, וְכוּתֵב שֶׁטָר על חֲצִי דָמָיו .</p> <p>וְחִזְרוּ בֵּית הַלֵּל לְהוֹרוֹת כְּבֵית שַׁמַּי</p>
<p>Pesachim 91</p> <p>The Gemara discusses the scope of this dispute: Rabba bar bar Hana said that Rabbi Yohanan said that the dispute is about an uncircumcised gentile that was circumcised and converted on Passover eve.</p> <p>Beit Hillel hold that there is a rabbinic decree due to a concern that perhaps he will become contaminated by a corpse in the following year and he will say: Last</p>	<p>פסחים צא</p> <p>אָמַר רַבָּה בַּר בַּר חַנָּה אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן: מִחֻלּוֹקֵת בְּעֶרְל גּוֹי ,</p> <p>דְּבֵית הַלֵּל סָבְרִי: גְזִירָה שֶׁשָּׂמָא יִטְמָא לְשָׁנָה הַבָּאָה, וַיֹּאמְרוּ: אֵי שֶׁתִּקְדַּד, מִי לֹא טְבַלְתִּי וְאַכְלִיתִי? עֲבָשִׁיו נִמְי אֶטְבּוֹל וְאוֹכֵל.</p>

year, even though I had come in contact with a corpse previous to Passover, **did I not immerse and eat** the Paschal lamb without completing the purification process for impurity imparted by a corpse? **Now also, I will immerse and eat. And he does not know** and understand **that last year**, before his conversion on Passover eve, **he was a gentile and therefore he was not susceptible to ritual impurity**, because gentiles do not contract ritual impurity according to Torah law, but **now he is a Jew and is susceptible to ritual impurity.**

And Beit Shammai hold that we do not make a decree due to this concern. **But** with regard to **an uncircumcised Jew** who for some reason had not been circumcised until Passover eve, **all agree that he may immerse and eat his Paschal lamb in the evening.** The concern that he will err the following year does not apply, **and we do not decree** in the case of an **uncircumcised Jew** who was circumcised on Passover eve, **due to** concern that the case will be confused with that of **an uncircumcised gentile** who was circumcised and converted on Passover eve.

וְלֹא יָדַע דְּאִשְׁתְּקַד — גּוֹי הָיָה וְלֹא מְקַבֵּל טוֹמְאָה,
עֲכָשְׂיוֹ — יִשְׂרָאֵל וּמְקַבֵּל טוֹמְאָה .

וּבֵית שַׁמַּי סְבָרִי: לֹא גְזָרִינָן.
אֲבָל עֶרְל יִשְׂרָאֵל — דְּבָרֵי הַכֹּל טוֹבֵל וְאוֹכֵל אֶת
פֶּסַח לְעֶרְב, וְלֹא גְזָרִינָן עֶרְל יִשְׂרָאֵל מִשּׁוּם עֶרְל גּוֹי.