

Nechama Goldman Barash

We Talk About the Four Sons but What About the Daughters????

<p>Haggada Text Four Sons (Translation Miriam Gedweiser) What does the wise [son] say? "'What are these testimonies, statutes and judgments that the Lord our God commanded you?' (Deuteronomy 6:20)" And accordingly you will say to him, as per the laws of the Pesach sacrifice, "We may not eat an afikoman [a dessert or other foods eaten after the meal] after [we are finished eating] the Pesach sacrifice (Mishnah Pesachim 10:8)."</p> <p>What does the wicked [son] say? "'What is this worship to you?' (Exodus 12:26)" 'To you' and not 'to him.' And since he excluded himself from the collective, he denied a principle [of the Jewish faith]. And accordingly, you will blunt his teeth and say to him, "'For the sake of this, did the Lord do [this] for me in my going out of Egypt' (Exodus 13:8)." 'For me' and not 'for him.' If he had been there, he would not have been saved.</p> <p>What does the innocent [son] say? "'What is this?' (Exodus 13:14)" And you will say to him, "'With the strength of [His] hand did the Lord take us out from Egypt, from the house of slaves' (Exodus 13:14)."</p> <p>And [regarding] the one who doesn't know to ask, you will open [the conversation] for him. As it is stated (Exodus 13:8), "And you will speak to your son on that day saying, for the sake of this, did the Lord do [this] for me in my going out of Egypt."</p>	<p>חכם מה הוא אומר? מה העדות והחקים והמשפטים אשר צוה ה' אלהינו אתכם. ואף אתה אמור לו כהלכות הפסח: אין מפטירין אחר הפסח אפיקומן:</p> <p>רשע מה הוא אומר? מה העבודה הזאת לכם. לכם – ולא לו. ולפי שהוציא את עצמו מן הכלל כפר בעקר. ואף אתה הקהה את שניו ואמור לו: "בעבור זה עשה ה' לי בצאתי ממצרים". לי ולא-לו. אלו היה שם, לא היה נגאל:</p> <p>תם מה הוא אומר? מה זאת? ואמרת אליו "בחזוק יד הוציאנו ה' ממצרים מבית עבדים."</p> <p>ושאינו יודע לשאול – את פתח לו, שנאמר, והגדת לבנך ביום ההוא לאמר, בעבור זה עשה ה' לי בצאתי ממצרים.</p>
---	---

Women's Obligation on Passover Despite Its Time Bound Nature

<p>Tosefta Chapter 2 Hazeret, matzah and pesah: on the first night of Pesach they are obligatory; on the rest of the days of Pesah, optional. Rabbi Shimon says: for men obligatory, for women optional</p>	<p>תוספתא מסכת פסחים (ליברמן) פרק ב החזרת והמצה והפסח לילי יום טוב הראשון חובה ושאר ימים רשות ר' שמעון או' לאנשים חובה לנשים רשות</p>
<p>Tosefta Pesachim Chapter 8:1 These [are required to] perform [Pesach] Sheni: Men and women who had abnormal discharges, menstruants, women who recently gave birth, [those who failed to observe Pesach Rishon] due to circumstances beyond their control, and those who erred unwittingly, and those who erred intentionally,</p>	<p>תוספתא מסכת פסחים (ליברמן) פרק ח אילו עושין את השני הזבין והזבות הנדות והיולדות האנוסין והשוגגין והמזידין והמצורעין ובוועלי נדות ומי שהיה טמא או בדרך רחוקה אם כן למה נאמ' טמא או בדרך רחוקה שבא הכת' לפוטרו מן ההכרת</p>
<p>Tosefta Pesachim 8:10 Pesah rishon is slaughtered for women only, but for pesah sheni she must join with others; the opinion of Rabbi Yehuda. Rabbi Yose says: pesah sheni may be slaughtered for women only and there is no need to say the same for pesah rishon. Rabbi Ele'azar ben Rabbi Shimeon says: for pesah rishon she must join others. A woman may not bring pesah sheni.</p>	<p>תוספתא מסכת פסחים (ליברמן) פרק ח הלכה י פסח ראשון שוחטין על האשה בפני עצמה והשני עושה טפילה אצל אחרים דברי ר' יהודה ר' יוסה או' פסח שיני שוחטין על האשה בפני עצמה ואין צריך לומר פסח ראשון ר' לעזר בי ר' שמעון או' פסח ראשון עושה טפילה אצל אחרין ואין עושה פסח שיני</p>
<p>B. Talmud Pesachim 43a Women are subject to the precept of eating unleavened bread by the law of Scripture, for it is said, "You shall not eat anything leavened with it" (Deut. 16, 3). Whoever is subject to not eating anything leavened is subject to the eating of unleavened bread; and these women since they are subject to the injunction of not eating anything leavened they are also subject to the precept: arise, eat unleavened bread."</p>	<p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת פסחים דף מג עמוד ב דאמר רבי אליעזר: נשים חייבות באכילת מצה דבר תורה, שנאמר לא תאכל עליו חמץ וגו' כל שישנו בבל תאכל חמץ - ישנו באכילת מצה. והני נשי נמי, הואיל וישנן בבל תאכל חמץ - ישנן בקום אכול מצה.</p>
<p>B. Talmud Pesachim 116a Our rabbis taught: If the son is wise, he asks; but if he is not wise, his wife asks; and if not, he asks himself questions. Even two scholars</p>	<p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת פסחים דף קטז עמוד א גמרא. תנו רבנן: חכם בנו - שואלו, ואם אינו חכם - אשתו שואלתו. ואם לאו - הוא שואל לעצמו. ואפילו שני תלמידי חכמים שיודעין בהלכות הפסח - שואלין</p>

who know the laws of Pesah ask questions of each other.	זה לזה.
---	---------

<p>MISHNA: In the case of one who says to his children: I am slaughtering the Paschal lamb on behalf of whomever of you goes up first to Jerusalem, as soon as the first of the children has entered his head and the majority of his body into Jerusalem, he has acquired his portion and acquires on behalf of his brothers their portions together with him.</p> <p>That was also taught: There was an incident such as this, and the daughters preceded the sons. And it turned out that the daughters were enthusiastic, the sons were lazy.</p>	<p>משנה מסכת פסחים פרק ח [ג] האומר לבניו הריני שוחט את הפסח על מי שיעלה מכם ראשון לירושלם כיון שהכניס הראשון ראשו ורובו זכה בחלקו ומזכה את אחיו עמו לעולם</p> <p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת פסחים דף פט עמוד א אמר רבי יוחנן: כדי לזרזן במצות קאמר תניא נמי הכי: מעשה וקדמו בנות לבנים, ונמצא בנות זריזות ובנים שפלים.</p>
--	---

<p>Pesahim 108a Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: Women are obligated in the four cups, since they too were involved in the miracle.</p> <p>Tosfot, Pesahim 108b: They too were involved in the miracle.” Rashbam understands this as a reference to the Aggadah that the Israelites were redeemed from Egypt because of the merit of the women. Similarly, the redemption commemorated by the Megillah was affected by Esther and that of Hannukah by Yehudit.</p>	<p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת פסחים דף קח עמוד א ואמר רבי יהושע בן לוי: נשים חייבות בארבעה וסות הללו, שאף הן היו באותו הנס.</p>
--	--

<p>Pesahim 108a A woman who is with her husband is not required to recline, but if she is an important woman, she is required to recline.</p> <p>Mordechai on Pesachim: And if she is an important woman, she is required to lean and according to the Tosafists, all of our women are important and are required to lean.</p>	<p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת פסחים דף קח עמוד א אשה אצל בעלה - לא בעיא הסיבה, ואם אשה חשובה היא - צריכה הסיבה</p> <p>מרדכי מסכת פסחים תוספת מערבי פסחים רמז תריא ואם אשה חשובה היא צריכה הסיבה פי' בתוספות דכולהו נשים דיזן חשובות נינהו וצריכות הסיבה</p>
---	---

<p>Rashbam, ad loc. A woman does not recline out of awe for her husband and her subordinate position (<i>obviously this interpretation is only valid in the case of a married woman who is in the presence of her husband. N.G.B.</i>)</p>	<p>רשב"ם על פסחים ק"ח א:א' אשה אינה צריכה הסיבה - מפני אימת בעלה וכפופה לו ומפרש בשאלות דרב אחאי לאו דרכייהו דנשי למיזגא כתב הר' מנוח אשה חשובה כלומר שאין לה בעל והיא גברת הבית א"נ אשה חשובה שיש לה עבדים ושפחות שאינה צריכה להתעסק בתיקון המאכל וענייני הבית.</p>
---	--

<p>Shulchan Arukh, Orach Chayim 472:4 (4) A woman does not recline unless she is important. (All of our women are called important, but they do not have the custom to recline because we rely on the words of the Ribah who wrote that at that time they do not recline.) Also the women are obligated in four cups and in all of the mitzvot observed on that same night. Rema's Comment: And they will say, in a language that women and children understand, or the matter will be explained to them and so did Rabbi Y. of Londari, who told the whole haggadah in secular language, so that the children and women will understand.</p>	<p>אורח חיים תע"ב:ד' (ד) אשה אינה צריכה הסיבה אלא אם כן היא חשובה: הגה וכל הנשים שלנו מיקרי חשובות (מרדכי ריש פרק ע"פ ורבינו ירוחם) אך לא נהגו להסב כי סמכו על ראבי"ה דכתב דבזמן הזה אין להסב (ד"ע): שולחן ערוך אורח חיים סימן תעב סעיף יד (מד) טז גם הנשים חייבות בארבע כוסות ובכל (מה) מצות הנהוגות באותו לילה. הגה ויאמרו בלשון שמבינים הנשים והקטנים או יפרש להם הענין וכן עשה ר"י מלונדר"י כל ההגדה בלשון לע"ז כדי שיבינו הנשים והקטנים:</p>
--	--

Women Who Helped Bring About the Redemption

Shemot Rabbah:

<p>B. Sotah 12a This legend was told by Rabbi Yehuda bar Zevena. Amram, the father of Miriam, was great in his generation. When he heard Pharaoh proclaim, "All the sons that are born, you shall cast into the Nile," Amram said, "We are toiling in vain." Amram divorced his wife and the men, following his example, also divorced their wives. "His daughter Miriam said to her father, "You condemned us more than Pharaoh because he only condemned the males, but you</p>	<p>תלמוד בבלי מסכת סוטה דף יב עמוד א וילך איש מבית לוי - להיכן הלך? אמר רב יהודה בר זבינא: שהלך בעצת בתו. תנא: עמרם גדול הדור היה, כיון (שראה שאמר) +מסורת הש"ס: [שגזר] + פרעה הרשע כל הבן הילוד היאורה תשליכוהו, אמר: לשוא אנו עמלין! עמד וגירש את אשתו, עמדו כולן וגירשו את נשותיהן. אמרה לו בתו: אבא, קשה גזירתך יותר משל פרעה, שפרעה לא גזר אלא על הזכרים, ואתה גזרת על הזכרים ועל הנקיבות! פרעה לא גזר אלא בעוה"ז, ואתה בעוה"ז ולעוה"ב! פרעה הרשע, ספק מתקיימת גזירתו ספק אינה מתקיימת, אתה צדיק בודאי שגזירתך מתקיימת, שנאמר: ותגזר אומר ויקם לך!</p>
--	--

<p>condemned the males and females. What Pharaoh decreed was only for this world but your decree is for this and the next world. "Pharaoh is a villain so there is doubt about whether his decree will be fulfilled, but you are a just man so it is sure that your decree will be obeyed."</p> <p>He arose and took his wife back and they all arose and took their wives back.</p> <p>And took to wife – it should have read 'and took back'! R. Judah b. Zabina said: He acted towards her as though it had been the first marriage; he seated her in a palanquin, Aaron and Miriam danced before her and the Ministering Angels proclaimed "A joyful mother of children."</p> <p>And Miriam the prophetess the sister of Aaron took - the sister of Aaron and not the sister of Moses? Rabbi Amram said in the name of Rav...this teaches that she used to prophesy when she was the sister of Aaron and say: In the future my mother will give birth to a son who will redeem Israel.</p> <p>"On the day Moses was born, the house was filled with light. Her father, Amram, kissed Miriam on the head and said "Your prophecy was fulfilled."</p> <p>"Three months later her brother was put into a basket and set floating on the Nile.</p> <p>"Her mother hit her on the head and asked, Daughter now where is your prophecy? That is why it is said in the Hebrew Bible. The child's sister took her stand at a distance to see what would happen to him" (Exodus 2:4)</p>	<p>עמד והחזיר את אשתו, עמדו כולן והחזירו את נשותיהן.</p> <p>ויקח - ויחזור מיבעי ליה! א"ר יהודה בר זבינא: שעשה לו מעשה ליקוחין, הושיבה באפריון ואהרן ומרים מרקדין לפניו, ומלאכי השרת אמרו: אם הבנים שמחה.</p> <p>ותקח מרים הנביאה אחות אהרן וגו' - אחות אהרן ולא אחות משה? אמר רב עמרם אמר רב, ואמרי לה אמר רב נחמן אמר רב: מלמד, שהיתה מתנבאה כשהיא אחות אהרן ואומרת: עתידה אמי שתלד בן שמושיע את ישראל; וכיון שנולד משה, נתמלא כל הבית כולה אור, עמד אביה ונשקה על ראשה, אמר לה: בתי, נתקיימה נבואתיך! וכיון שהטילוהו ליאור, עמד אביה וטפחה על ראשה, אמר לה: בתי, היכן נבואתיך! והיינו דכתיב: ותצב אחותו מרחוק לדעה מה יעשה לו, לידע מה יהא בסוף נבואתה.</p>
--	---

Sotah 11b

§ Rav Avira taught: In the merit of the righteous women that were in that generation, the Jewish people were redeemed from Egypt. He tells of their righteous actions: At the time when these women would go to the river to draw water, the Holy One, Blessed be He, would materialize for them small fish that would enter into their pitchers, and they would therefore draw pitchers that were half filled with water and half filled with fish. And they would then come and place two pots on the fire, one pot of hot water for washing their husbands and one pot of fish with which to feed them. And they would then take what they

prepared to their husbands, to the field, and would bathe their husbands and anoint them with oil and feed them the fish and give them to drink and bond with them in sexual intercourse between the sheepfolds, i.e., between the borders and fences of the fields, as it is stated: "When you lie among the sheepfolds, the wings of the dove are covered with silver, and her pinions with the shimmer of gold" (Psalms 68:14), which is interpreted to mean that as a reward for "when you lie among the sheepfolds," the Jewish people merited to receive the plunder of Egypt, as it is stated in the continuation of the verse, as a reference to the Jewish people: "The wings of the dove are covered with silver, and her pinions with the shimmer of gold" (Psalms 68:14). And when these women would become pregnant, they would come back to their homes, and when the time for them to give birth would arrive they would go and give birth in the field under the apple tree, as it is stated: "Under the apple tree I awakened you; there your mother was in travail with you; there was she in travail and brought you forth" (Song of Songs 8:5). And the Holy One, Blessed be He, would send from the heavens above an angel who would clean and prepare the newborns, just as a midwife prepares the newborn, as it is stated: "And as for your birth, on the day you were born, your navel was not cut nor were you washed with water for cleansing; you were not salted at all, nor swaddled at all" (Ezekiel 16:4). This indicates that there were no midwives to take care of the Jews born in Egypt. And then, the angel would gather for them two round stones from the field and the babies would nurse from that which would flow out of them. One of the stones flowed with oil and one of the stones flowed with honey, as it is stated: "And He would suckle them with honey from a crag and oil from a flinty rock" (Deuteronomy 32:13). And once the Egyptians would notice them, realizing that they were Jewish babies, they would come to kill them. But a miracle would occur for them and they would be absorbed by the earth. And the Egyptians would then bring oxen and would plow upon them, as it is stated: "The plowers plowed upon my back; they made long their furrows" (Psalms 129:3). After the Egyptians would leave, the babies would emerge and exit the ground like grass of the field, as it is stated: "I caused you to increase even as the growth of the field" (Ezekiel 16:7). And once the babies would grow, they would come like many flocks of sheep to their homes, as it is stated in the continuation of the verse: "And you did increase and grow up and you came with excellent beauty [*ba'adi adayim*]" (Ezekiel 16:7). Do not read the verse as: "*Ba'adi adayim*," "with excellent beauty." Rather, read it as: *Be'edrei adarim*, meaning: As many flocks. And when the Holy One, Blessed be He, revealed Himself at the Red Sea, these children recognized Him first, as it is stated: "This is my God, and I will glorify Him" (Exodus 15:2). They recognized Him from the previous time that He revealed Himself to them in their infancy, enabling them to say: "This is my God." § The verse states: "And the king of Egypt spoke to the Hebrew midwives, of whom the name of the one was Shiphrah, and the name of the other Puah" (Exodus 1:15).

§ The verse states: "And the king of Egypt spoke to the Hebrew midwives, of whom the name of the one was Shiphrah, and the name of the other Puah" (Exodus 1:15). Rav and Shmuel disagree as to the proper interpretation of this verse. One says that these midwives were a woman and her daughter, and one says that they were a daughter-in-law and her mother-in-law. According to the one who says that they were a woman and her daughter, the women were Jochebed, the mother of Moses and Aaron, and her daughter, Miriam. And according to the one who says that they were a daughter-in-law and her mother-in-law, the verse is referring to Jochebed and her daughter-in-law Elisheba, the wife of Aaron. It is taught in a *baraita* according to the one who says that they were a woman and her daughter, because it is taught in a *baraita*: With regard to Shiphrah, who is referred to in the verse, this

is really a reference to **Jochebed**. **And why was she called Shiphrah? Because she would prepare [mishapperet] the newborn.** Alternatively, she is referred to as **Shiphrah because the Jewish people increased and multiplied [shepparu verabbu] in her days**, due to her assistance. The *baraita* continues: With regard to **Puah**, who is referred to in the verse, **this** is really a reference to **Miriam**. **And why was she called Puah? Because she would make a comforting sound [po'a] as she would remove the child from the womb of the mother.** Alternatively, the word **Puah** is related to one of the verbs that describe speaking, **as she would speak [po'a] through divine inspiration and say: In the future, my mother will give birth to a son who will save the Jewish people.** The next verse relates the instructions of Pharaoh to the midwives: **“And he said: When you deliver the Hebrew women, and you look upon the stones [ovnayim], if it be a son, then you shall kill him; but if it be a daughter, then she shall live”** (Exodus 1:16).

B. Talmud Megilla 13a

“And his wife *HaYehudiyya* bore Jered the father of Gedor, and Heber the father of Soco, and Jekuthiel the father of Zanoah. And these are the sons of Bithiah the daughter of Pharaoh, whom Mered took” (I Chronicles 4:18). **Why is she referred to as *Yehudiyya*? Because she repudiated idol worship, as it is written: “And the daughter of Pharaoh came down to wash herself in the river”** (Exodus 2:5), **and Rabbi Yoḥanan said: She went down to wash and purify herself from the idols of her father’s house.** The Gemara asks: Pharaoh’s daughter bore Moses? **But didn’t she merely raise him? Rather, it is telling you that with regard to anyone who raises an orphan boy or girl in his house, the verse ascribes him credit as if he gave birth to him.**

“ואשתו היהודיה ילדה את ירד אבי גדור ואת חבר אבי שוכו ואת יקותיאל אבי זנוח ואלה בני בתיה בת פרעה אשר לקח מרד.” אמאי קרי לה “יהודיה” — על שנים ששפרה בעבודת זרה, דכתיב: “ותרד בת פרעה לרחוץ על היאור”, ואמר רבי יוחנן: שתרדה לרחוץ מגילולי בית אביה. “ילדה”? והא רבויי רביתיה! לומר לה שכל המגדל יתום ויתומה בתוך ביתו — מעלה עליו הכתוב כאילו ילדו.

Midrash Tanhuma Pekudei 9:1 You find that when the Israelites suffered hard labour in Egypt that Pharaoh decreed that they should not sleep at home nor have relations with their wives. Said R. Simeon ben Halafta: What did the daughters of Israel do? They would go down to draw water from the river. Whereupon the Holy One Blessed be He prepared small fishes for them inside their jars. They would cook some, sell some and buy with the proceeds wine and go out into the fields and give their husbands to eat there. After they had eaten they took their mirrors and looked into them together with their husbands. She said: I am more comely than you. He said: I am more comely than you. In the course of this tete-a-tete their sexual desire was aroused and they became fruitful and multiplied, the Holy One Blessed be He forthwith remembering them (i.e. blessed them with issue) as it is stated: “and the children of Israel were fruitful and swarmed and multiplied and became exceedingly mighty”

9:4

....As soon as the Holy One Blessed be He told Moses to make the Tabernacle, all Israel came along to contribute. Some brought silver, some gold or brass, onyx and stones to be set. They

readily brought everything. Whereupon the women said: What have we to contribute to the offerings of the Tabernacle? They came along and brought the mirrors and presented themselves to Moses. When Moses saw the mirrors he was furious with them. He said to Israel: Take sticks and break their thighs of those who brought them. What use are such mirrors? Said the Holy One Blessed be He to Moses: Moses! You look down on them! It was these mirrors which raised up all those hosts in Egypt! Take them and make out of them the basin and its stand for the priests in which they can purify themselves, as it is stated And he made the basin....



David Moss, The Moss Hagagadah Companion Volume

Every child is unique and the Torah embraces them all. The iconography that I've chosen here is based on playing cards. As in a game of chance, we have no control over the children dealt us. It is our task as parents, as educators to play our hand with the attributes of the children we are given. It is the child not the parent who must direct the process. This I believe is the intent of the midrash of the four children.